

Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill
Rural Affairs, Islands and Natural Environment Committee - Call
for views
Response from the Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland

December 2021

Established by the Commissioner for Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2003, the Commissioner is responsible for promoting and safeguarding the rights of all children and young people in Scotland, giving particular attention to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC). The Commissioner has powers to review law, policy and practice and to take action to promote and protect rights.

The Commissioner is fully independent of the Scottish Government.

Introduction

The Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland welcomes the opportunity to offer views on the [Good Food Nation \(Scotland\) Bill](#). Food insecurity significantly affects children and young people across Scotland and the realisation of their human rights. Urgent action is needed to address the root causes of food insecurity and ensure that children and young people's right to food is universally realised through systemic change that ensures all children and young people have access to quality, healthy nutritious food.

We have made several recommendations, which would serve to strengthen the provisions within this Bill and ensure that they comply with international human rights standards, particularly the [United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child \(UNCRC\)](#) and the [International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights \(ICESCR\)](#). This would be in line with the Scottish Government's commitment to incorporate the UNCRC into Scots law and its aspiration for Scotland to be the best place for children to grow up.

The Scottish Human Rights Commission has produced a detailed [submission](#) on the Bill, which we support.

Legal Framework

The right to food as a human right is enshrined in international human rights law in article 11 of the ICESCR. Article 11 recognises that:

- everyone has the right to an adequate level of food,
- governments must take measures to improve the production, conservation, and distribution of food,
- governments must tell people about the principles of nutrition,

- governments should develop or reform the ways they produce food so that natural resources are developed and used in the most efficient way, and
- the world's food supplies should be distributed in an equitable way.

The [UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights](#) provided further guidance in its [General Comment no. 12 on the right to adequate food](#). The right to food is comprised of four key elements: 1.) availability, 2.) adequacy, 3.) accessibility, and 4.) sustainability – for present and future generations. 'Adequacy' refers to the dietary needs of an individual which must be fulfilled not only in terms of quantity but also in terms of nutritious quality. 'Accessibility' includes affordability; individuals in all settings should be able to have an adequate diet without it affecting their other basic needs, such as housing, fuel, and other key costs.

The right to food directly engages the following human rights enshrined in the UNCRC:

- Article 6 – the right to life, survival, and development
- Article 26 – the right to social security
- Article 27 – the right to an adequate standard of living

The right to food is also closely linked to children's rights to health (UNCRC article 24) and education (UNCRC articles 28 and 29), among others.

The impact of food insecurity on children and young people in Scotland

Children and young people in Scotland have told us that poverty is the single-most important issue for them. This includes food poverty. The [2019 Children's Future Food Inquiry](#) highlighted that food insecurity is a longstanding serious problem for children UK-wide, particularly those living in poverty. Thousands of children across Scotland currently live with food insecurity - where they do not have consistent access to sufficient affordable, nutritious food.

[Food insecurity affects](#) children's physical and mental health and lifelong development. Children who experience food insecurity are more likely to face adverse health outcomes, developmental risk, educational performance, obesity, and malnutrition. It also affects educational performance.

[Three of the main causes](#) of food insecurity are low income, benefit delays, and benefit changes. These, combined with increasing housing, food, and fuel costs, affect parents/carers' ability to afford essential material needs, including food. As a result, children and their families are reliant on both food banks and free school meals for access to food.

Prior to 2021, there was [no single nationwide government measure for hunger](#) in the United Kingdom (UK)¹ and quality disaggregated data remains lacking at devolved or UK level. Prior to the pandemic, [an estimated 1.9 million children](#) experienced food insecurity across the UK. In 2019, 720,504 children UK-wide, including 80,623 in Scotland, [received food from 1,200 foodbanks](#),² with a 13% increase in food bank use in Scotland to feed children between 2018/19 and 2019/20. In January 2021, [2.3 million children in the UK](#) lived in households that had experienced food insecurity in the previous 6 months (12% of households with children) and 10% of households with children reported food insecurity in January 2021 alone.

Scottish Government analysis of the [Households Below Average Income, 2019/20 data tables](#)³ found that 25% of children in Scotland lived in households with marginal, low, or very low food security in 2019/20. Furthermore, children living in poverty in Scotland were less likely to have high food security: just 48% of those in relative poverty and 49% of those in absolute poverty lived in high food security households.⁴

Food insecurity [has also worsened](#) since the onset of the Covid-19 pandemic. To date, there is no comprehensive data on the number of children affected by food insecurity in the wake of the pandemic.

Free school meals are a crucial measure that help ensure children's right to food is fulfilled. We welcome the extension of free school meals for all children up to Primary 5 from January 2022. The pandemic has demonstrated that a cash-first approach to the provision of free school meal alternatives when schools closed was essential and most effective.

Further challenges with free school meals include eligibility - [as the threshold does not include all children affected by poverty](#), quantity - particularly at secondary level, the amount of money provided, and the potential stigma of being a recipient. In 2019, [a young person told us](#) of the limitations of free school meals, noting, *"I only get £2.55 on my card so I can't afford very much. Sometimes I can only get a juice or a drink and a snack."*

¹ The Department for Work and Pensions (DWP) measured food insecurity for the first time in its annual Food and Resources Survey, with first data sets available in March 2021.

² This represented around two-thirds of foodbank provision.

³ Most of the figures in these data tables come from DWP, 2021, *Family Resources Survey: financial year 2019 to 2020*, <https://www.gov.uk/government/statistics/family-resources-survey-financial-year-2019-to-2020>. The Family Resources Survey includes ten questions on household food security but the questions do not directly ask about the food security of children. Social Market Foundation, 2020, *Measuring and mitigating child hunger in the UK*; <https://www.smf.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/Measuring-mitigating-child-hunger-Dec-20.pdf>

⁴ Scottish Government, March 2021, *Poverty and Income Inequality in Scotland 2017-20*, <https://data.gov.scot/poverty/>; *Child Poverty Trends Food Security*, https://data.gov.scot/poverty/#Child_poverty.

[Childhood obesity is of concern in Scotland](#), particularly between the ages of 12 and 15 and for children living in poverty. Poverty and deprivation are associated with poor nutritional outcomes. [Across the UK](#), there is a marked socio-economic gradient for childhood obesity and children in the most deprived parts of the country do not grow as well and are on average a centimetre shorter by the time they reach age 11 than children in the richest areas.

Children and young people across Scotland [have told us](#) how food insecurity affects them. In 2016, one child pointed out, *“When you’re hungry all you can think about is food.”* Another told us of the impact of food insecurity on learning stating, *“It’s really hard to concentrate.”* Children also talked about the potential impact of financial insecurity and not having enough to eat, stating that children feel upset, stressed, worried, and scared.

On nutrition, Young Scottish Ambassadors working with the [Future Food Inquiry](#) highlighted how easy it was for school pupils to eat unhealthy foods. [One Ambassador stated](#), *“In our community there is a dot-to-dot of takeaways lining our streets. They offer lunchtime specials to school children, they are even promoted on our bus tickets.”*

When talking about causes and solutions, children across all research groups for [our 2016 joint report](#) identified poverty as the most significant reason why some children may not have the food they need. When talking about the role of politicians in addressing food insecurity, one child said, *“They’re meant to look after us, they shouldn’t just be sitting there not caring and eating all the food.”* Children further identified the need for action, including steps to address poverty and homelessness, as well as practical measures, such as making fruit and vegetables cheaper and increasing the price of sweets to ensure healthy eating. Finally, they highlighted the importance of engaging with children when making decisions about the right to food. One child told us, *“... listen to everything that every child says [...] and take it all in and write it down and do all [she] can.”*

The UN Committee on the Rights of the Child,⁵ the [UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights](#), and the [UN Special Rapporteur on Extreme Poverty and Human Rights](#) have expressed concern about the links between poverty and food insecurity in Scotland, their impact on children, and barriers to the right to food for children, as well the efficacy of measures such as free school meals in realising the right to food for all children and young people in Scotland.

⁵ In its [2016 findings and recommendations](#) and its [request for information for the current reporting cycle](#).

Recommendations

In order to ensure a Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill that addresses food insecurity for all and ensures universal access to healthy nutritious food, we recommend the following points for your consideration:

- **Rights-based approach** : The provisions in the Bill must be underpinned by a child rights-based approach. A comprehensive child rights-based approach should include data collection and monitoring, consideration of children's rights in decision-making, meaningful engagement with children and young people in decision-making processes, child rights budgeting, and transparency in resource allocation. [Child Rights Impact Assessments](#) (CRIAs) should be routinely undertaken and published on all legislative and policy decisions affecting children and children should be consulted throughout.
- **Incorporation of the right to food**: We have previously called for the incorporation of the right to food into Scots Law as part of the Good Food Nation legislation. The UNCRC (Incorporation)(Scotland) Bill and Scotland's National Taskforce on Human Rights Leadership have committed to incorporating a number of international human rights treaties into national law. This Bill does not fully reflect those commitments. The Bill only requires that Scottish Ministers' and public bodies' plans are prepared *having regard to* elements of the right to food. Incorporating the right to food into Scots law would help reduce inequalities and support compliance with international human rights obligations and the 2030 Sustainable Development Goals.
- **Participation of children and young people in decision-making processes concerning them**: Children and young people should be involved in a meaningful way in the development of Good Food plans. This is in line with Article 12 of the UNCRC, which sets out that children and young people have a right to participate in decision-making processes relevant to them, in line with their evolving age and maturity.⁶ Engagement with children and young people must be meaningful, tailored, and accessible, including targeted consultations.
- **Data collection, targets, monitoring and reporting**: The Bill/Good Food plans should set clear and ambitious targets, indicators, measures and timeframes in relation to the right to food. In line with [recommendations received from the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child](#), the Bill should include requirements for the systematic collection of quality, disaggregated data concerning food security and nutrition, including for children, and regular monitoring and analysis of this data and of the effectiveness of policies and programmes on food security and nutrition. Such policies and programmes

⁶ The UN Committee on the Rights of the Child provides additional guidance concerning children's right to be heard in its [General Comment no. 12](#).

include those for children, such as school meal programmes, food banks, and programmes addressing infants and young children.

In 2016, one child described the impact of food insecurity stating, “*living is more important than surviving.*” Good nourishment and nutrition are essential for children and young people to reach their full potential and to survive and thrive. We look forward to continuing to engage and to seeing the development of a Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill that will deliver for all children and young people across Scotland.

For more information, please contact: Helen Griffiths, Policy and Engagement Officer: Helen.Griffiths@cypcs.org.uk; 07754-800-269.